

literature in McAuliffe's work, one major way the overall project could be improved is by providing the reader with illustrations portraying the development of Muslim thought on particular themes and topics, such as the interpretation of particular Qur'anic verses or social issues such as marriage and divorce, instead of presenting an excerpt from a particular author for a given topic. In the final analysis, this volume can be taken as a valuable attempt that can lead to more sophisticated instructional materials on Islam. For this purpose, incorporating the voice of instructors during this development process can be practically useful in designing such a 'canon'.

KAMRAN BASHIR

University of Victoria

DOI: 10.3366/jqs.2016.0228

NOTES

1 Carl Ernst and Richard C. Martin (eds), *Rethinking Islamic Studies: From Orientalism to Cosmopolitanism* (Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 2010).

2 For the original reference, see Jonathan Z. Smith, 'Religious Studies: Whither (Wither) and Why?' in Christopher I. Leirich (ed.), *On Teaching Religion: Essays by Jonathan Z. Smith* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. 64–72.

3 Tomoko Masuzawa, *The Invention of World Religions, Or, How European Universalism Was Preserved in the Language of Pluralism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005).



The Sufi Doctrine of Man: The Metaphysical Anthropology of Ṣadr al-Dīn al-Qūnawī. By Richard Todd. Islamic Philosophy, Theology, and Science. Texts and Studies, 90. Brill: Leiden, 2014. Pp. 222 + bib. + index. £83.00. ISBN 9789004271234.

The great medieval figure Ṣadr al-Dīn al-Qūnawī (d. 673/1274) was, by disposition and profession, both a 'mystic' and a 'philosopher'. It thus comes as no surprise to learn that the same person who was the stepson and foremost student of Ibn ʿArabī (d. 638/1240) and a close friend of Jalāl al-Dīn Rūmī (d. 672/1273) had also initiated a serious and sustained philosophical correspondence with Naṣīr al-Dīn al-Ṭūsī (d. 672/1274) after having read his commentary upon Ibn Sīnā's (d. 428/1037) highly influential *al-Ishārāt wa'l-tanbīhāt*. Alongside his spiritual training and deep knowledge of the intellectual sciences, al-Qūnawī was a Shāfiʿī jurist and master of *ḥadīth*, having taught the great scientist and Illuminationist philosopher Quṭb al-Dīn al-Shīrāzī (d. 710/1300) in the latter discipline. Al-Qūnawī was naturally the immediate successor of Ibn ʿArabī, and went on to train a number of individuals who would all become major representatives of the 'school' of Ibn ʿArabī, such as the

Persian poet Fakhr al-Dīn ʿIrāqī (d. 688/1289), Saʿīd al-Dīn al-Farghānī (d. c. 699/1299), and Muʾayyid al-Dīn al-Jandī (d. 700/1300).

Al-Qūnawī is commonly known as the figure most responsible for the philosophical and systematic explication of Ibn ʿArabī's teachings, thereby effectively setting in motion the work of a unique and far-ranging perspective in later Islamic intellectual history commonly referred to as *al-ʿirfān al-naẓarī* or 'theoretical Šūfism'. Yet al-Qūnawī was not just a systematiser of his master's teachings. Rather, he managed to take some of the most essential aspects of Ibn ʿArabī's thought, as well as some ideas to which the shaykh did not assign a particularly prominent place, and integrate them into his own spiritual and intellectual vision. The result of this fusion has long been recognised as a pristine exposition of Šūfī metaphysics. This is why the great Persian poet and sage ʿAbd al-Raḥmān Jāmī (d. 898/1492) famously remarked that the only way of entry into the Akbarian universe was through the portal of al-Qūnawī's writings.

An understanding of al-Qūnawī's life, writings, and thought is essential for anyone who wishes to come to terms with the complex relationship between philosophy and mysticism in the eastern lands of Islam from the post-classical to the modern periods. In this respect Richard Todd's book *The Sufi Doctrine of Man* is a most welcome contribution. Its English style, quality of translations from various Arabic and Persian texts, historical range of topics covered, and depth of analysis of al-Qūnawī's recondite ideas are all first rate.

The book is divided into eight chapters, with the first four chapters (Part 1) devoted to al-Qūnawī's life, a content-catalogue of his writings, and his intellectual context (pp. 13–80). Of the remaining four chapters (Part 2), three provide us with penetrating analyses of al-Qūnawī's thought, and the last briefly outlines its historical reception (pp. 83–176). One major author surprisingly not covered in Todd's survey, and who was deeply influenced by al-Qūnawī's understanding of the Qur'an in particular, was the great Šafavid philosopher Mullā Šadrā (d. 1050/1640).¹

A useful glossary of philosophical and Šūfī terms (pp. x–xvii) precedes the introduction (pp. 1–10), which itself puts al-Qūnawī in his proper political, historical, cultural, and intellectual contexts while also giving us an overview of his image in the pertinent medieval biographical literature. Lastly, three helpful appendices are also included. The first of these (pp. 179–192) outlines a running list of writings attributed to al-Qūnawī (60 in total, two thirds of which are likely spurious), giving the manuscript information and, where relevant, helpful publication details for each of them. The second appendix (pp. 193–4) provides us with MS photo images of al-Qūnawī's own hand-written *ijāzas* that he administered to his aforementioned students al-Farghānī and al-Jandī, and the third appendix (pp. 195–213) is something

of an annotated anthology of a number of essential passages from al-Qūnawī's *oeuvre* on the theme of epistemology.

A particularly useful feature of this book is its overview of al-Qūnawī's life. Although Jane Clark's study of al-Qūnawī's biography is more comprehensive in this regard,² Todd presents a nice synthesis of the various relevant materials, and also draws on a few unexplored sources. Al-Qūnawī was born in the Seljuq sultanate of Rūm in roughly 605/1208–9, where his father Majd al-Dīn Ishāq, who was a friend of Ibn ʿArabī, was the Shaykh al-Islām (p. 13). After al-Qūnawī's father died Ibn ʿArabī married al-Qūnawī's mother (pp. 13–14). Thus, at some point in his youth, perhaps at the age of fifteen (620/1223), al-Qūnawī moved to Damascus and became a formal member of Ibn ʿArabī's household as his stepson (*rabīb*) (pp. 14–15). Although we cannot know for certain when al-Qūnawī was initiated into Šūfism by his first teacher, the great Persian Šūfī master Awḥad al-Dīn Kirmānī (d. 636/1238), Todd sees this as likely happening at a young age (pp. 15–16), perhaps before he came to Damascus and was taken into the care of Ibn ʿArabī.

In roughly 630/1232–3, after a number of years of training in the *ḥadīth* sciences as well as intense formal study under Ibn ʿArabī, al-Qūnawī was granted an *ijāza* by Ibn ʿArabī to transmit all of his writings (pp. 15–17). This period, when al-Qūnawī was in his mid twenties, was marked by constant travel between Egypt, Rūm, and Damascus. After Ibn ʿArabī's death, al-Qūnawī eventually settled in Konya, where he spent the last two decades of his life (p. 21). It is here that al-Qūnawī trained several of his most influential disciples, and authored many of his important works (pp. 23–5). Shortly after leading Rūmī's funeral prayer (*janāza*), al-Qūnawī himself fell ill, and died eight months later in Konya on 16 Muḥarram 673 / 22 July 1274 (p. 27).

With respect to al-Qūnawī's thought, early on in the book Todd makes two essential points which, in one way or another, inform the rest of his inquiry:

First, contrary to what meets the eye, al-Qūnawī's language and overall concerns are in fact deeply scriptural in their nature (p. 51 and p. 64). This explains why one of his most important works, *Iʿjāz al-bayān*, is a profound metaphysical commentary upon the *Fātiḥa*, and another one of his books is an equally sophisticated but incomplete commentary upon a collection of 40 *ḥadīths* (pp. 32–5, pp. 43–4). Although Todd engages these texts in the context of the wider aims of his book, he is not concerned with explicating al-Qūnawī's understanding of the Qur'an as such, taking in as it does his wide-ranging metaphysics, cosmogony, and cosmology. Such a topic is justifiably the work of a different study, which is precisely why Todd devotes a separate (and phenomenal) article to the subject.³ At any rate, Todd's point about the scripturally-oriented nature of al-Qūnawī's language and worldview is made abundantly clear throughout *The Sufi Doctrine of Man* in both the texts from

al-Qūnawī presented in translation and Todd's attendant analyses of and annotations upon them (p. 80, pp. 87–8, p. 95, p. 97, p. 99, p. 102, pp. 104–5, pp. 107ff., etc.).

Second, although al-Qūnawī's writings evince a better acquaintance with and appreciation for the Avicennian tradition than Ibn ʿArabī, he is no less a critic of the formal limitations of discursive knowledge and rational inquiry (p. 50, p. 146, etc.). With this point in mind, Todd demonstrates how, in the context of his correspondence with al-Ṭūsī, al-Qūnawī opposes some key ideas of the Islamic philosophers. Chief in this regard is the philosophers' Neoplatonic emanationist cosmology, which al-Qūnawī is against on the grounds that the chain of intermediate causes between God and the material world which comes part and parcel with the philosophers' emanationist cosmology severely undercuts the notion of God's direct and palpable effect upon every level of existence (p. 57). Al-Qūnawī also distances himself from the Peripatetics and philosophical theologians in that he is directly opposed to *jadal* or disputation in the pursuit of attaining knowledge (p. 54, pp. 210–11).⁴ For al-Qūnawī, one must acquire knowledge 'through God Himself' (i.e. by way of *kashf* or 'unveiling') rather than through one's own cognitive powers and intellectual abilities (p. 213). And, in no uncertain terms, al-Qūnawī is also at odds with the philosophers for their insistence on an immaterial afterlife, as well as the same three positions singled out by al-Ghazālī (d. 505/1111) in his *Tahāfut al-falāsifa* for the charge of '*kufr*'—the denial of bodily resurrection, God's inability to know particulars qua particulars, and the eternity of the world (p. 61).

Yet, as Todd reminds us, al-Qūnawī also manages to incorporate a number of the Islamic philosophers' ideas into his own thought by way of direct borrowing and/or the now well-documented post-Avicennian naturalisation of the philosophers' views and terminology into the sciences of theology and even theoretical Ṣūfism. That is to say, although al-Qūnawī distances himself from the philosophers' emanationist cosmology on one level, he retains certain elements of it on another (p. 77). In him we find, for example, the First Intellect (*al-ʿaql al-awwal*), which corresponds to the Muḥammadan spirit (p. 68), namely the level of createdness directly below the 'uncreated' aspect of divine manifestation, which itself corresponds to the Muḥammadan Reality (*al-ḥaqīqa al-Muḥammadiyya*), the Breath of the All-Merciful (*nafas al-raḥmān*) (for which, see p. 71 and p. 80), and what al-Qūnawī calls 'expansive being' (*al-wujūd al-munbasit*).

We also find the usual philosophical language of contingents and contingency in al-Qūnawī's cosmology, which again betrays a certain indebtedness to the Islamic philosophers. Yet, where they see the operation of secondary causes only, which al-Qūnawī would not deny on one level (as would also be the case with Ibn ʿArabī), his basic starting point is the oneness and all-manifestness of *wujūd*, which is tantamount to the Absolute (*al-muṭlaq*) or God qua manifestation

(i.e. *al-wujūd al-munbasiṭ*), or what Ibn ʿArabī and his school commonly refer to as the level of Inclusive Oneness (*wāḥidiyya*). What informs this cosmic picture is nothing other than emanation or self-disclosure (*tajallī*). Although al-Qūnawī uses these terms, he is more wont to employ the word *taʿayyun* ('determination' or 'entification', p. 85), which after him becomes a key notion in Ṣūfī metaphysics. This term alone affords him the kind of specificity vis-à-vis God's relationship to each creature that is squarely not possible in the philosophers' usual emanative conception of the cosmos. For al-Qūnawī, as the Absolute looks upon the objects of Its self-knowledge, which are nothing other than the immutable entities (*al-aʿyān al-thābita*) or what the philosophers (and sometimes al-Qūnawī) call 'quiddities' (*māhiyyāt*) (p. 91 and p. 93), the cosmic order and the entities contained within it begin to emerge by way of God's self-disclosure or self-determination.

So God is extensionally identical with each thing insofar as these things are so many determinations of the one *wujūd*, which perpetually manifests itself in its new guises in accordance with the what-it-is-ness (i.e. *māhiyya* or 'quiddity') of each object of His knowledge. Insofar as God is 'behind' each manifest form, He is the immediate and direct cause of it. Yet insofar as each thing is separate from God by virtue of the ultimately unmanifest and hidden dimension of the Essence (what is known from Ibn ʿArabī onwards as the level of *aḥadiyya* or Exclusive Oneness), each thing has its own place amidst the constellation of secondary causes.

Todd also highlights some other unique features of al-Qūnawī's thought, one of the most prominent examples being his well-known doctrine of the 'five divine presences' (*al-ḥadarāt al-ilāhiyya al-khams*). After this teaching receives its first distinctive formulation by al-Qūnawī, it would become a major point of interest for many authors in the Akbarian and cognate traditions for centuries to follow. As Todd notes (p. 98, n. 70), Ibn ʿArabī speaks of the divine presence and divine presences generically, but does not have anything like a particular schema in which the differing degrees of cosmic reality are reified and 'localised' into five, proceeding from the unmanifest divine presence Itself to the perfect man (*al-insān al-kāmil*), who takes in the other three levels (namely the spiritual, the imaginal, and the sensory).

Now what is to be made of all of this emphasis upon cosmology and the subsequent introduction of man into the mix? This takes us to Todd's fundamental insight in his book: the key nexus between God and the cosmic order is none other than man himself, which explains the all-important subtitle of Todd's study. What this means is that God's self-disclosure, in accordance with His self-objectivisation, allows for the infinite number of possibilities to emerge from Himself, thereby allowing Him to see Himself in an objective manner. The subject that emerges as a potential mirror is the human being. But immersed in the realm of matter, he is unable to ascend and purify himself of the dross of duality which taints his soul. If he is able to emerge from the

quagmire of separation and return to the ultimate source from which he came in its pristine purity, he attains the level of humanity that is appropriate to his true nature. Such an individual becomes God's objective mirror into which He gazes upon Himself, thereby fulfilling the goal of the creation of man (pp. 155ff.).

In the final analysis, the 'metaphysical anthropology' which Todd has in mind ties into every aspect of the human project, from man's origin (*mabda'*), to the mid-way point or his time on earth, and ultimately to his return (*ma'ād*) to his place of origin. We therefore have here a 'humanism' of the first order, but one in which the human can only 'be' by virtue of God 'being'. This anthropology is precisely a science of man because man in the first instance is a theomorphic creature. For al-Qūnawī, then, the goal of being human is perfection; that is, for man to come to know himself in the same way as God knows him to be for all of eternity (for some implications of this position, see p. 136 and pp. 160ff.).

Richard Todd's *The Sufi Doctrine of Man* joins the ranks of a handful of studies devoted to al-Qūnawī since the appearance of Nihat Keklik's Turkish-language monograph published in 1967.⁵ The most noteworthy of these recent contributions include Anthony Shaker's detailed book on al-Qūnawī's technical language and conceptual universe⁶ and Ekrem Demirli's extensive body of scholarship on him in Turkish, which consists of two full-length studies of his thought and complete translations of all of his major works.⁷ There are also several collections of articles dedicated to al-Qūnawī,⁸ a translation of one of his most significant shorter treatises,⁹ and a couple of other particularly helpful studies on aspects of his thought.¹⁰

For some reason, none of these newer contributions are taken into consideration by Todd in his otherwise excellent study (cf. pp. 1–2). Engagement with them would have provided him with an even more solid basis for his inquiry, especially since his many original conclusions complement the findings of these studies, and, in a number of cases, improve upon them. Richard Todd's *The Sufi Doctrine of Man* nevertheless represents the single most comprehensive treatment of al-Qūnawī's thought to date. It puts within easy reach the ideas of one of medieval Islam's most notoriously difficult thinkers, and as such is essential reading for all serious students of Islamic thought.

MOHAMMED RUSTOM

Carleton University

DOI: 10.3366/jqs.2016.0229

NOTES

1 For Ṣadrā's reliance on al-Qūnawī in this regard, see Mohammed Rustom, *The Triumph of Mercy: Philosophy and Scripture in Mullā Ṣadrā* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2012), index s.v. 'Qūnawī, Ṣadr al-Dīn'. To these borrowings we can add another one, namely a sentence from Ṣadrā's introduction to his most important theoretical work on the Qur'an which

is reworked from a line in al-Qūnawī's major work on the Qur'an. See Rustom, *The Triumph*, p. 12; and Todd, *The Sufi Doctrine of Man*, p. 33, n. 27, for the respective passages in translation. For a study of both al-Qūnawī and Ṣadrā (but which is not comparative as such), see the late Muḥammad Khwājawī's *Dū Ṣadr al-Dīn* (Tehran: Intishārāt-i Mawlā, 1999).

2 Jane Clark, 'Towards a Biography of Sadr al-Dīn Qūnawī', *Journal of the Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi Society* 49 (2011), pp. 1–34. This article is available at <http://www.ibnarabisociety.org/articles/sadr-al-din-qunawi-life.html>.

3 To be published in Annabel Keeler and Sajjad Rizvi (eds), *Beyond the Letter: Approaches to the Esoteric Interpretation of the Qur'an* [working title] (Oxford: Oxford University Press in association with The Institute of Ismaili Studies, forthcoming).

4 For al-Qūnawī's treatment of this question, see the lengthy text translated by William Chittick in Mohammed Rustom, Atif Khalil, and Kazuyo Murata (eds), *In Search of the Lost Heart: Explorations in Islamic Thought* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2012), pp. 114–17.

5 Nihat Keklik, *Sadreddin Konevî'nin felsefesinde Allah-Kâinât ve İnsan* (Istanbul: Edebiyat Fakültesi Matbaası, 1967).

6 Anthony Shaker, *Thinking in the Language of Reality: Ṣadr al-Dīn Qūnawī (1207–74 CE) and the Mystical Philosophy of Reason* (n.p.: Xlibris, rev. edn 2015).

7 His scholarly contributions are documented in Mohammed Rustom, 'A Conversation with Ekrem Demirli, Turkey's Leading Scholar of Ibn 'Arabi and Qūnawī', *Journal of the Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi Society*, forthcoming.

8 See the proceedings of the two conferences held on al-Qūnawī in Konya in 2008 and 2011: Hasan Yaşar (ed.), *I. Uluslararası Sadreddin Konevî Sempozyumu Bildirileri* (Konya: MEBKAM Yayınları, 2010); and Hasan Yaşar (ed.), *II. Uluslararası Sadreddin Konevî Sempozyumu Bildirileri* (Konya: MEBKAM Yayınları, 2014). Also, volume 49 of the *Journal of the Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi Society* (2011) is dedicated to al-Qūnawī. A few of the articles in this special issue of the journal are to be found at <http://www.ibnarabisociety.org/journals.html>.

9 See William Chittick's abridged translation of al-Qūnawī's *Nuṣūṣ*, published as 'The Texts' in S.H. Nasr and Mehdi Aminrazavi (eds), *An Anthology of Philosophy in Persia* (5 vols. London: I.B. Tauris in association with The Institute of Ismaili Studies, 2008–15), vol. 4, pp. 416–34. Chittick's complete translation is available at http://www.academia.edu/8101330/Sadr_al-Din_Qunawi_The_Texts_al-Nusus_.

10 See Christian Bonaud, 'La correspondance entre Ṭūsī et Qūnawī (première partie)', *Farhang* 61–2 (2007), pp. 95–149; and William Chittick, 'The Central Point: Qūnawī's Role in the School of Ibn 'Arabi', *Journal of the Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi Society* 35 (2004), pp. 25–45. The latter article can be accessed at http://www.academia.edu/7334659/The_Central_Point_Qunawi_s_Role_in_the_School_of_Ibn_Arabi.



Iconic Books and Texts. By James W. Watt (ed.). Sheffield: Equinox Publishing, 2013. Pp. vi + 436. HB £60.00/\$19.95, PB £19.99/\$29.95. ISBN 978–1–84553–985–6.

The writings of Wilfred Cantwell Smith and William A. Graham (among others) have taught scholars a great deal about the idea of 'scripture', what it is and how it is received by those who honour the text. Displaced are the presumptions that one only